Building a Strong, Stable & Diverse Educator Workforce: What LEAs Can Do

November 13, 2019
CCSESA Recruitment & Retention Symposium

Tara Kini
Director of State Policy
@LPI_Learning
@ms_kini
Teacher preparation enrollments are down ~ 70%
Out-of-State Credentials

New California Teaching Credentials Issued for Individuals Prepared Out-of-State and Out-of-Country and the (%) as Compared to Total New Teaching Credentials
80% of Districts Report Shortages

Percent of Districts Reporting Shortages for the 2017-18 School Year

- Shortage: 80%
- No Shortage: 20%

Chart Source: Analysis of LPI 2017-18 CA School District Survey
13,000 Teachers Hired on Substandard Credentials

Substandard Permits and Credentials, 2012–13 to 2017–18

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total Permits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012–13</td>
<td>4,724</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013–14</td>
<td>6,077</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014–15</td>
<td>7,681</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015–16</td>
<td>10,209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016–17</td>
<td>12,346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017–18</td>
<td>13,149</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

178% INCREASE

Source: Data provided by the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing by request.
Teachers on Emergency-Style Permits Have Increased Nearly 600%

Provisional and Short Term Permits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Permits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>851</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>1,181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>2,409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>4,069</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-17</td>
<td>5,710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-18</td>
<td>5,886</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data provided by the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing by request.
Shortages Disproportionately Impact Students of Color and Low-income Students

Shortages Disproportionately Impact Schools Serving Historically Disadvantaged Students

Percent of principals hiring teachers on substandard credentials or leaving positions vacant, by school characteristics

- High proportion of FRPL students***: 66.7%
- Low proportion of FRPL students***: 42.8%
- High proportion of students of color*: 65.4%
- Low proportion of students of color*: 47.9%

Notes: Statistically significant differences denoted by * p<0.10, ** p<0.05, *** p<0.01. “Low proportion” represents schools in the bottom quartile; “high proportion” represents schools in the top quartile. FRPL is the free and reduced-price lunch program.

Source: Learning Policy Institute analysis of GDTFII 2018 Principal Survey conducted by the RAND Corporation.
Exacerbating the Leaky Bucket

Teachers with little/no preparation

Lower student outcomes

Higher attrition (2-3 times greater than those who are well-prepared)
Key Findings from Positive Outliers Study

• % of teachers on substandard credentials (interns, permits, waivers) is most significant predictor of student achievement for all students (-)

• Teacher experience matters too, especially for students of color (+)
6 in 10 New Special Ed Teachers Are Underprepared

Special Education Preliminary and Substandard Credentials Issued, 2011–12 to 2017–18
Half Of New Math/Science Teachers Are Underprepared

Trends in Mathematics and Science Teacher Supply
Preliminary and substandard credentials issued, 2011-12 to 2016-17

Math
- Preliminary Credentials: 50%
- Substandard Credentials: 86%

Science
- Preliminary Credentials: 40%
- Substandard Credentials: 137%
More than 50% of districts surveyed in Spring 2017 reported a shortage of bilingual teachers.
All Students Benefit from a Racially Diverse Teacher Workforce

Teachers of color:

- Fill hard-to-staff positions
- Boost academic performance
- Improve attendance rates
- Influence school climate
- Improve satisfaction
- Offer benefits to all students
California Teacher Diversity

Chart Source: Analysis of CA Department of Education Dataquest, 2016–17.
Teacher Attrition Drives Nearly 90% of Demand

Figure 13:
What is Driving Teacher Shortages in California?
New Credentials, Teacher Demand Factors, and Hires

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>New CA Credentials</th>
<th>Hires</th>
<th>Demand</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>11,550</td>
<td>14,080</td>
<td>3,679</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>11,487</td>
<td>11,301</td>
<td>4,503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-17</td>
<td>12,285</td>
<td>8,970</td>
<td>3,454</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: A negative number of teachers represents a decrease in the total number of teachers.
Source: California Staffing Data File provided to the Learning Policy Institute by the CDE through a special request; California Department of Education. Data available on DataQuest Web Page at [http://data1.cde.ca.gov/dataquest/](http://data1.cde.ca.gov/dataquest/); California Commission on Teacher Credentialing through a special request.
Types of Reasons Given by Teachers for Leaving the Profession

Source: LPI analysis of the Teacher Follow-Up Survey (TFS), 2013, from the Schools and Staffing Survey, National Center for Education Statistics.
Administrative Support Impacts Teacher Turnover

SCHOOL ADMINISTRATION IS SUPPORTIVE

- Strongly Agree
- Somewhat Agree
- Somewhat Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

More than 2x greater
Compensation Impacts Turnover

Note: Brackets represent 95% confidence interval of the estimate.
Preparation Impacts Turnover

Note: Brackets represent 95% confidence interval of the estimate.
Turnover Has Costs

- Teacher quality
- School stability
- Student achievement
- Financial costs
Teacher Turnover Has Costs

1. How many teachers left your school or district?

Enter the number of teachers who left last year. Don't know? Use the tab above to let us help you calculate an estimate.

Estimated Cost of Turnover *

$8,400,000

Cutting turnover in half would save

$4,200,000

* Teacher turnover is costly, and not just in dollars. Studies show that student achievement suffers in schools with high turnover.

2. What's the cost of replacing a teacher?

Use the slider to estimate the cost of replacing a teacher in YOUR school or district. As you think about the costs, remember to factor in all expenses and person hours related to processing a teacher's exit, as well as costs to recruit, hire, and train new teachers. Read more.

Don't know? Use one of our district estimates:

- Rural District
- Suburban District
- Urban District

Barriers to Recruiting & Retaining Teachers of Color

- The cost of college
- Obstacles to completing college & preparation
- Insufficient preparation
- Challenging teaching conditions
## 2017-2018 District Survey: What Can The State Do to Reduce Shortages?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy Solution</th>
<th>Percent of Districts Agreeing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Loan forgiveness or service scholarship programs</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher residency and other Grow-Your-Own programs</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support and mentoring for all novice teachers</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce cross-state barriers for veteran teachers</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater articulation between CC and teacher prep programs</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparation and PD for school leaders</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affordable housing for teachers</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve working conditions e.g. time for collaboration</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create/expand education academies as part of CTE</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce barriers for retired teachers to return</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percent of districts that agree the policy solution can reduce teacher shortages

Source: Analysis of LPI 2017-18 CA School District Survey
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Amount/Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California Classified Staff Teacher Credentialing Program</td>
<td>$45M (2016, 2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated Teacher Preparation Program Grant</td>
<td>$10M for grants to IHEs to develop or expand 4-year teacher preparation programs (2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California Center on Teaching Careers</td>
<td>$5M to recruit new teacher candidates (2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilingual Professional Development Program</td>
<td>$5M (2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CalED Grant Program</td>
<td>$2.7M for teacher recruitment &amp; retention, $6.5M school leader development (2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Education Local Solutions Grant Program</td>
<td>$50M (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Residency Grant Program</td>
<td>$75M for teacher residencies ($50M special ed, $25M STEM/bilingual) (2018)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 2019-20 Budget Year Investments in the Education Workforce

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Golden State Teacher Grant Program</td>
<td>$89.75M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educator Workforce Investment Grant Program</td>
<td>$37.1M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21\textsuperscript{st} Century California School Leadership Academy</td>
<td>$13.8M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California Subject Matter Projects</td>
<td>$6.7M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Learning and Care Workforce Development Grants</td>
<td>$195M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
So What Can LEAs Do To Build a Strong, Stable, and Diverse Teacher Workforce?
Positive Outlier Case Study Districts

- Gridley USD
- Hawthorne SD
- Long Beach USD
- Chula Vista ESD
- Clovis USD
- Sanger USD
- San Diego USD
Findings from Positive Outlier Districts

1. Finding and hiring effective educators
   - Relationships with teacher education programs
   - Grow-Your-Own strategies
   - Clear hiring policies

2. High staff retention
   - Strong working conditions
   - Positive culture
   - Climate of teacher support
3. Stable, instructionally engaged leadership

4. Collective instructional capacity
Interactive Map: Understanding Teacher Shortages in California

A district- and county-level analysis of the factors influencing teacher supply and demand

This map highlights a number of key factors that reflect and influence teacher supply and demand and signal whether California districts and counties are likely to have an adequate supply of qualified teachers to fill their classrooms.

When live, this map will be available at:
learningpolicyinstitute.org/interactive-map-teacher-shortages-california
Teacher Shortages in California: Status, Sources, and Potential Solutions

Linda Darling-Hammond, Leib Sutcher, and Desiree Carver-Thomas

Abstract
Teacher shortages have been worsening in California since 2011. Growth in teacher demand due to the economy has increased but remains below where it should be to meet the needs of the state. California's teacher shortages are severe and have been getting steadily worse over the last few years. After years of budget cuts and layoffs, the 2014-15 school year brought an upturn in the economy, along with a voter-approved funding initiative (Proposition 30), and higher school finance reform (Local Control Funding Formula). These enabled school districts to begin rebounding from the Great Recession, many replaced teachers who had been lost during years of shrinking budgets and teacher layoffs. As districts posted new job openings, they discovered that qualified teachers were not so hard to find. Since then, the shortage has deepened. In response, the state has invested nearly $200 million over the last several years to recruit, prepare, support, and retain teachers.

Acknowledgments
The report upon which this is based was funded by the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, the Annie E. Casey Foundation, the Carnegie Corporation of New York, the Ford Foundation, the Joyce Foundation, the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, the Walton Family Foundation, and the William and Flora Hewlett Foundation. The Center for the Future of Teaching and Learning at the University of Washington, led by Debra Gang and including Lucy Hailwood, provided assistance in data analysis and interpretation. The authors also thank the members of the Learning Policy Institute's technical advisory board, whose insights and feedback are gratefully acknowledged.

Stay Up to Date!
Sign up for updates bit.ly/LPlupdates

LPI Resources on Teacher Shortages
https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/news/resources-teacher-shortages-united-states

Email Tara Kini
Director of State Policy
tkini@learningpolicyinstitute.org

Closing the Opportunity Gap
How Positive Outlier Districts in California Are Pursuing Equitable Access to Deeper Learning

Dion Burns, Linda Darling-Hammond, and Caitlin Scott
with Taylor Albrittain, Christine Connor-Thompson, Cynthia Garnett, Marina Jorn, Allison B. Kline, Laura J. McEwan, Kate E. Merienne, Julie A. Mitchell, Crystal A. Morley, Anne Ruscak, Patricia A. Shuda, and Jenie M. Tabachnik
1. What strategies are you pursuing to build a strong, stable, and diverse teacher workforce in your LEA?

2. What challenges are you encountering in this work?